

Phil. 103: Introduction to Logic

Class Exercise: Diagramming Arguments

Directions: For each of the following paired statements, (1) state the fact at issue as a question phrased in neutral language, (2) state whether or not there is a disagreement in belief or attitude or both, and (3) tell in general the preferred method for resolving the dispute.

- Richard Murphy, CEO of the Tri-Magma Corporation, animatedly discussed the future of the company with an alacrity seldom seen in today's economic climate.
 - CEO Murphy chattered on and on with grossly unrealistic expectations about Tri-Magma's prospects in these difficult times.

(1) Did Richard Murphy talk about the future prospects of Tri-Magma Corporation? (2) *a* and *b* agree in belief toward that issue but disagree in attitude. (3) The method of resolution would be to use some form of rhetoric and persuasion.

- Susan Donnelly, the film critic, can be relied upon as an independent reviewer who enthusiastically offers her opinions without reservation.
 - I don't know why Susan Donnelly, the movie commentator, is so disagreeable—she always contradicts the media's other film critics.

(1) Does the critic Susan Donnelly think for herself? (2) *a* and *b* agree in belief toward that issue but disagree in attitude. (3) The method of resolution would be to use some form of rhetoric and persuasion.

- John Webster claimed he would ace the GRE; in fact, the score he achieved was amazingly only five points below what he predicted.
 - Yeah, well, Webster failed to meet his expectation. His prediction was too high; he should have studied more.

(1) Did John Webster obtain the score on the GRE he predicted? (2) *a* and *b* agree in belief toward that issue but disagree in

attitude. (3) The method of resolution would be to use some form of rhetoric and persuasion.

4. *a.* The Woodsglen neighborhood generously raised over a hundred dollars for the Lymphoma Society's Annual Drive
b. The Woodsglen subdivision struggled to get a paltry hundred dollars for the Society's annual fund drive.

(1) How much did the people who live in Woodsglen contribute to the Lymphoma Society? (2) *a* and *b* agree in belief toward how much was contributed but disagree in attitude as to whether that amount was appropriate for the neighborhood. (3) The method of resolution would be use some form of rhetoric and persuasion.

5. *a.* Little Eddie is so cute when he creatively invents new rules while playing games with his playmates.
b. Little Eddie is a brat. His little friends are quite annoyed at his repeated cheating while he plays with them.

(1) Does Little Eddie play games in strict accordance with the rules? (2) *a* and *b* agree in belief toward that he does not but disagree in attitude as to whether or not that action should be approved. (3) The method of resolution would be to use some form of rhetoric and persuasion.

6. *a.* Senator Jenkins maintained a sullen countenance and refused to comment on the dubious goals of the proposed measure.
b. Senator Jenkins exhibited an abiding interest in the proposed measure before the committee while extolling the best case scenarios projected for the program.

(1) Did Senator Jenkins talk about the subject at issue? (2) *a* and *b* disagree about whether or not he spoke about the matter at issue and disagree in attitude toward Senator Jenkins and the program. (3) The method of resolution would be to find the facts by, for example, viewing a video of Senator Jenkins at that time or interviewing persons who witnessed his actions. After the facts were found, then, if *a*'s or *b*'s attitude did not change, some form of rhetoric and persuasion could be used to influence attitudes.