

Phil. 103: Introduction to Logic

Translation to Standard Form

Licensed under the GFDL

1. Translate the following passage into three standard form statements with matched classes. Is the passage an argument?

“Only those for whom art is a constant source of passionate emotion can possess the data from which profitable theories may be deduced; but to deduce profitable theories even from accurate data involves a certain amount of brain-work, and, unfortunately, robust intellects and delicate sensibilities are not inseparable.”¹

Suggested Answer:

(1) All persons possessing data from which profitable theories may be deduced are persons for whom art is a constant source of passionate emotion. (In exclusive statements, the order of the subject and predicate terms must be reversed.)

(2) All persons possessing data from which profitable theories may be deduced are persons who do a certain amount of brain-work.

(3) Some persons possessing data from which profitable theories may be deduced are not persons for whom art is a constant source of passionate emotion.

Bell seems to be inferring something to the effect that not all intellectuals can be aesthetes, or as expressed in our classes, he means to infer (3) from (1) and (2). If this analysis is charitable, then the argument would exhibit the fallacy of the illicit process of the major term. More likely, however, Bell is just implying the obverse of the last statement, i.e., “Robust intellects and delicate sensibilities are (sometimes) separable” or perhaps better, “Not all robust intellects have delicate sensibilities.”

2. Translate the quotation below. Is the converse validly implied?

“By failing to prepare you are preparing to fail.”²

Suggested Answer:

All times you fail to prepare are times you prepare to fail.

Converse: All times you prepare to fail are times you fail to prepare

Evaluation: The conversion of an A statement is invalid.

3. Translate these two statements into standard form. Explain whether the second statement logically follows from the first.

¹Clive Bell, *Art* (London: Chatto & Windus: 1914), 19.

²Benjamin Franklin, quoted in Ted Goodman, ed., *The Forbes Book of Business Quotations* (London: Black Dog Publishing, 2007), 481.

“If the Products of Nature rise in Value, according as they more or less resemble those of Art, we may be sure that artificial Works receive a greater Advantage from their Resemblance of such as are natural.”³

Suggested Answer:

(1) All values increases for products of nature are value increases resembling those of art.

(2) All values increases resembling those of art are value increases for productions of nature.

Addison’s inference is mistaken. The conversion of an A statement is invalid.

4. Translate the conclusion of this dilemma into standard form.

“Good times, bad times, there will always be advertising. In good times people want to advertise; in bad times they have to.”⁴

Suggested Answer:

All good times are times for advertising. All bad times are times for advertising.

Note that the conclusion is a compound statement.

5. Translate the enthymeme into standard form and test for validity.

“No opera plot can be sensible, for people do not sing when they are feeling sensible.”⁵

Suggested Answer:

Major Premise: No events when opera is sung are times when the singers feel sensible.

Implicit Minor Premise: [All performances of opera plots are events when opera is sung.]

Conclusion: No performances of opera plots are times when the singers feel sensible.

Evaluation: The foregoing is one possible reconstruction. On this interpretation, the syllogism is valid but arguably unsound. Please note, however, the context of this remark is not to inform and so charitably should not be taken as an argument, but rather as a witty comment.

³Joseph Addison, *The Spectator* (London: George Routledge and Sons, Ltd., 1891), No. 414 Wednesday, June 25, 1712.

⁴Bruce Barton, Chairman of BBDO, quoted in James B. Simpson, *Contemporary Quotations* (Binghamton, NY: Vail-Ballou Press: 1964), 82.

⁵W.H. Auden quoted in Walter Bernhart, *Word and Music Studies* (Amsterdam: Rodopi, 2006), 295.